



Cornell  
University  
ILR Review

---

Review: [untitled]

Author(s): Lamont E. Stallworth

Reviewed work(s):

Justice in Dismissal-The Law of Termination of Employment. by Hugh Collins

Source: *Industrial and Labor Relations Review*, Vol. 47, No. 4 (Jul., 1994), p. 711

Published by: Cornell University, School of Industrial & Labor Relations

Stable URL: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/2524671>

Accessed: 12/01/2010 13:35

---

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of JSTOR's Terms and Conditions of Use, available at <http://www.jstor.org/page/info/about/policies/terms.jsp>. JSTOR's Terms and Conditions of Use provides, in part, that unless you have obtained prior permission, you may not download an entire issue of a journal or multiple copies of articles, and you may use content in the JSTOR archive only for your personal, non-commercial use.

Please contact the publisher regarding any further use of this work. Publisher contact information may be obtained at <http://www.jstor.org/action/showPublisher?publisherCode=cschool>.

Each copy of any part of a JSTOR transmission must contain the same copyright notice that appears on the screen or printed page of such transmission.

JSTOR is a not-for-profit service that helps scholars, researchers, and students discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content in a trusted digital archive. We use information technology and tools to increase productivity and facilitate new forms of scholarship. For more information about JSTOR, please contact [support@jstor.org](mailto:support@jstor.org).



Cornell University, School of Industrial & Labor Relations is collaborating with JSTOR to digitize, preserve and extend access to *Industrial and Labor Relations Review*.

<http://www.jstor.org>

dian federalists. Third, they almost completely ignore the large industrial relations literature on union-management relations in Canada indicating a significant communication gap between researchers contributing to knowledge about people at work.

Despite some warts here and there, the chapters in this book are generally of high quality, and they will reward careful readers with much useful information and reflection on unions in the United States and Canada.

Roy J. Adams

Professor of Industrial Relations  
McMaster University

### Labor and Employment Law

*Justice in Dismissal—The Law of Termination of Employment.* By Hugh Collins. New York: Oxford University Press, 1992. 277 pp. ISBN 0-19-825435-0, \$59.00.

Hugh Collins's goal in this book is to articulate a "conception of justice in the workplace" for unfair dismissal proceedings under the Employment Protection (Consolidation) Act of 1978. Collins eschews a single theory of justice in dismissal, arguing that separate analyses are needed to address disciplinary dismissals, economic dismissals, and dismissals for exercising "public rights." He observes that "rival conceptions of justice in dismissal," based on differing paradigms of the employment relationship, are used in legislation and case law. Using an "interpretative approach," he assesses the degree to which each paradigm advances the ideals of autonomy and individual dignity. He also examines the degree to which the rival conceptions of justice explain the law in each particular dismissal context and the relationships among the contexts.

According to Collins, the choice among paradigms must ultimately be based on moral considerations of individual rights, and those concerns are the focus of his book. He recognizes, however, that the choices must be tempered to avoid adverse consequences for industrial relations, manpower policies, employers' personnel practices, and other general welfare considerations.

Collins analyzes several discrete problems of justice in dismissal. For example, he identifies four paradigms used to determine whether disciplinary dismissals are substantively "fair," and evaluates their "moral strengths and weaknesses"

as well as "their potential to provide independent normative guides to good industrial practice." He concludes that one criterion—whether the employee's conduct harmed the business's interests or posed a risk of such harm—predominates in the Industrial Tribunals' decisions. He then modifies that criterion to address its perceived moral weaknesses. Specifically, he stipulates that the harm be recognized and acted upon by other employers in that business and that it be a substantial harm. Collins similarly articulates a set of principles for recognizing and protecting public rights in the workplace, such as privacy, free speech, safety, strikes, equality, and family life.

Whether or not one agrees with his conclusions, Collins has taken a principled and well-articulated stand in assessing competing points of view. This is a well-written, well-researched, and challenging book.

Lamont E. Stallworth

Professor  
Institute of Human Resources and  
Industrial Relations  
Loyola University, Chicago

### Income and Social Security and Substandard Working Conditions

*Job Security in America: Lessons from Germany.* By Katharine G. Abraham and Susan N. Houseman. Washington, D.C.: Brookings Institution, 1993. xi, 175 pp. ISBN 0-8157-0076-8, \$28.95 (cloth); ISBN 0-8157-0075-x, \$11.95 (paper).

American employers typically rely on layoffs to downsize their work force. Although the authors of this book recognize that downsizing is unavoidable in any market economy, they contend that American government policy encourages employers to overuse layoffs, and they present tightly reasoned arguments for making changes designed to promote alternative employer responses to cyclical shifts in product demand. Even readers who are less sanguine than the authors about the success of their specific proposals will find this book valuable, because of the craftsmanship with which issues are developed, the way in which empirical evidence is brought to bear on them, and the clarity of the arguments for change.

The cornerstone of any argument for policy change is a careful response to the "what if"